Mapping the Professions in World Perspective

Ellen Kuhlmann, e.kuhlmann@em.uni-frankfurt.de

The transformations of many societies into service economies have created a new importance of the sociology of professions across the globe. At the same time, these developments call for a critical revision of existing theoretical approaches for various reasons. The neoliberal turn in the western world has fundamentally changed the concepts of the welfare state and the governance of professions. The economic breakdown and the subsequent austerity politics and structural adjustment programmes in some regions have furthermore curbed the, for many years, prospering markets and public funding sources for professional services (Kuhlmann et al. 2015).

At the same time, rapidly emergent capitalist societies, like the BRICS countries, and other forms of economic, political and cultural transformations especially in middle to lower-middle income countries, have created new demand for professional expertise and services (in public and private sectors). Little is known on how the dynamics of globalization and the local/national transformations in societies play out across the globe (Kuhlmann, 2013). There is a dearth of knowledge on the intersections between constrained public sectors in many mature welfare states of the western world and emergent service societies with new demand for professional services in the global south and other parts. How do these far-reaching changes, then, impact in and alter the concepts of professions, professionalism and professionalization?

The case studies presented below, for the first time, offer a more complex and nuanced picture of the professions and professionalism. The country cases include material drawn from research carried out in South Africa, India, Argentine, Russia, Turkey and the Arab countries. The authors address topical issues and take us on a journey into a wide range of professional fields from academia, law and journalism to social work and medicine in their respective countries of research.

This collection of papers is a stepping stone to new ‘glocalizing’ approaches in the study of professions which critically reflect on the ‘contexts’ of theory development and empirical data. The floor is open for a global dialogue that is sensitive to local perspectives and contexts – but be prepared: this may be challenging and turn existing knowledge upside-down.


Please note: the contributions that follow are first drafts.
Case Study: South Africa

Developments in the Sociology of Professions in World Perspectives: Approaches from South Africa

Debby Bonnin, University of Pretoria, and Shaun Ruggunan, University of KwaZulu-Natal, South Africa

As sociologists it’s a truism to say that the study of human societies is always located in the context of a particular society; that the abstraction of ideas about society and the way it ‘works’ – its organisation, social groups and human interactions – cannot be divorced from the context. Yet the reality is that often this does happen, and the contexts in which theories are developed are forgotten and the dynamics of particular societies are divorced from their historical and geographical context and universalised. We therefore welcome the invitation from Ellen Kuhlmann to reflect on developments in the sociology of professions in world perspectives. By giving colleagues some background in the way in which professions have developed in South Africa as well as the issues that are pertinent to that context we hope to spark reflective and critical debates within the Sociology of Professions more broadly.

In 2013 we edited a special issue of the South African Review of Sociology – Towards a South African Sociology of Professions (2013). The purpose of the special issue was to encourage work on the professions, showcase the existing (South African) work but also to demonstrate the questions and issues that a southern perspective on the sociology of professions might bring to the existing literature and debates.

Historically the sociology of professions has not achieved much purchase within South African sociology. The revisionism of the 1970s (see for example Johnson 1976) and what Webster (2004) terms the ‘critical sociology’ of the late 1970s and 1980s resulted in the sociology of work engaging with the labour movement (Buhlungu 2009) and studying the conditions of production and reproduction of the black working class (see for example Sitas 1983, Webster 1985, von Holdt 2003). This does not mean that there has been no research on middle class occupations and white collar work – some of the classic studies that come to mind are that of Shula Mark’s book Divided Sisterhood examining the nursing profession, Blade Nzimande’s (1991) doctoral study of black managers and Liz Walker’s (2001, 2003, 2005) pioneering work on white female doctors.

However the framing of these studies and the questions they have asked has not resonated with some of the traditional debates concerning the sociology of professions (see Crompton 1990, Evetts 2003). It could be that in a society where so many were denied access to these professions, on the basis of their race, many sociologists saw such questions as irrelevant; or it could have been the turn to a more public sociology taken by so many sociologists of work (see the discussions by Buhlungu 2009, Burawoy 2004, Webster 2004); or it could have been that the functionalist paradigm within which much of the sociology of professions operated was rejected by South African sociologists of work (see Webster 2004).
Social closure has always been fundamental to any professionalisation project. Historically South African professional occupations have used race (and gender) to exclude black South African’s (see Vavi 2012, Walker 2001, 2003, 2005, and Webster 2004) from skilled occupations and thus shape the labour market in particular ways. The Apartheid state was central to this project and through various legislation (from labour to educational to petty apartheid) actively safeguarded the whiteness of the state bureaucracy and middle-class occupations.

We suggest that in post-Apartheid South Africa an examination of professional occupations has become increasingly important in assessing the success of the State’s project to ‘deracialise’ the labour market. Furthermore, opening access to professional and expert occupations is vital to ‘growing’ an African (or Black?) middle class. Traditional professions such as medicine, law, accounting and engineering are still primarily white, male occupations (see Jawitz et al 2000, Mulder 2012, Vavi 2012). The historic occupational closure of these professions to Black people and women has resulted in racial and gendered skewedness to the composition of these professions. Labour market statistics (StatsSA 2012) tell us that 54.8 percent of those in skilled occupations (i.e. managers, professionals and technician occupations) are male, with a higher proportion of male managers (69%) and a higher proportion of female technicians (55.7%). Whites constituted the highest proportion of all racial groups in skilled occupations (62.6%), Indians follow at 48.2 percent while black Africans are the least likely to be employed in high-skilled occupations (16.1 percent) (StatsSA 2012: 4-15–4-18).

But quantitative work on labour market compositions does not reveal the full story of how occupational closure takes place. We argue that what is needed are more qualitative studies to demonstrate the complexity of labour market formation, opportunities to enter professions and the ways in which occupational closures take place. The sociology of professions can contribute by providing insights into how professional cultures, professional status and professional labour processes contribute to practises of occupational closure for women, black graduates and others wishing to enter these professions.

We also believe that a sociology of professions would be able to make a key contribution to the national discourse on professionalism and the need to develop a professional public service culture. A key theme running through the National Development Plan (NDP) (National Planning Commission 2011, see chapters 9, 10, 13, 14) is the need to build a more professional culture amongst educators, health workers and public sector workers. Whilst professionalism and professional culture are not explicitly defined in the NDP – professional status, skill, certification and competence seem to be at the heart of its discussion on professionalism – these are related to improving the accountability and service delivery of the State. Thus the NDP correlates effective public service delivery with inculcating a new professionalism (through training) and professional culture amongst public service workers.

A Human Sciences Research Council study (Daily News, 8 March 2013) shows that only 0.4 percent of managers employed by the public services have the requisite professional qualifications to effectively practice their jobs. This supports research findings in the Department of Health identifying a lack of professional managerial qualifications in the health
sector as a major contributor to lack of public health. A consequence was that 100 hospital chief executives were replaced by candidates with ‘professional’ qualifications. The professional project in this respect is about producing a capable state through a professional project. As sociologists, this new state professional project should be of immense interest as it allows us to interrogate processes and assumptions of what professions, professionals and professional cultures mean in the context of a developmental state.

We also believe that a South African Sociology of Professions has much to offer the international literature. Firstly, the literature that examines the emergence of professions and the State’s role in professionalisation is dominated by empirical work drawn from a northern context (European, USA and British), theoretical frameworks are then extrapolated from these empirical examples and presented as normative. Research drawing on southern examples disrupts such a theoretical hegemony and shows that the role played by the modernising enlightenment state or the welfare state is just one trajectory amongst others, e.g. the colonial state or the post-colonial state.

Secondly, we would suggest that race and gender are key issues of social closure that a South African Sociology of Professions would highlight for an international literature of professions. Whilst race and gender resonate in the existing professions literature, they resonate in different ways in a South African context. For example in South Africa those that have been racially excluded from professions and high-skilled occupations are in the majority as opposed to being in a minority in Europe, Australia and North America.

Thirdly, in South Africa, the discourse of professionalism extends beyond what have traditionally been seen as expert or high-skill occupations. Many lower-skilled occupations are laying claim to this discourse in an attempt to both gain occupational legitimacy and control access. We would suggest that this strategy is about both increasing status and cornering access to a labour market. These strategies acquire urgency given that so many are denied access to decent work, employment and protection in the labour market. In most cases these examples demonstrate discourses of professionalism both from ‘within’ as well as from ‘above’ (Evetts 2011).

In conclusion we think that there is much work that needs to be done and to which the sociology of professions could contribute. Firstly, there is limited research on the public sector. Research in this area would be able to address a multitude of concerns from the nature of the post-Apartheid state’s professionalisation project to ‘professions in organisations’. There is also a need for historical research that documents the professionalisation of occupations in South Africa and the collusions (or lack of) between professional associations and the apartheid state. Finally we need research that examines how, or if, professions and expert occupations continue to monopolise a segment of the labour market for their members and how this interacts with racial and gender exclusivity and dominance. Some of this work is being done. Our plea is that the empirical work is used to engage the sociology of professions literature and, in turn, shape and challenge that literature from a South African/southern perspective.
References


Gilbert L. 1998b. ‘Pharmacy’s Attempts to Extend its Roles – A Case Study of Amendments to Legislation and Special Permit Holders in South Africa.’ Social Science & Medicine, 47: 153-164.


Contact addresses
Debby Bonnin
University of Pretoria
South Africa
Email: debby.bonnin@up.ac.za

Shaun Ruggunan
University of KwaZulu-Natal
South Africa
Email: ruggunans@ukzn.ac.za
Globalization and Legal Professions in India

Virendra P. Singh, University of Allahabad, India

India has world’s second largest legal profession with more than 600,000 lawyers. The predominant service providers are individual lawyers, smaller family based firms (Joshi, S. 2014). The majority of lawyers are in active practice are engaged in litigation work at three levels: mainly at the district or lower courts; at the High courts or at the Supreme Court. However, a very small percentage of lawyers work in law firms as transaction lawyers (Julian, A. Francis 2009). The impact of globalization is mainly on transactional work rather than on litigation work in the courts at various levels. Globalization has mainly affected this section of lawyers, mainly engaged in transactional work. Therefore, the present paper is focused on analyzing the impact of globalization on this emerging elite section of the legal profession of India. But before we analyse the impact of globalization on legal profession in India, it seems necessary to understand the evolution of legal education and profession in India in last 240 years.

Evolution of Legal Education and Profession in India

India has a colonial past and the legal education and profession have passed through different phases of evolution before the forces of globalization have penetrated them in the last decade of 20th Century and brought some structural changes in them. Here this process of evolution is discussed very briefly.

The legal profession in India evolved in British period with enforcement of Regulating Act of 1773 which empowered to enroll advocates and Attorneys-at-law to the Supreme Court. Although the Supreme Court was actually established one year later in Bengal, through a Charter issued in 1774. At that time, Indian lawyers were not allowed to appear in the courts. It could be possible with Bengal Regulation VII of 1793 which created for the first time a regular legal profession in India for the East India Company’s courts by allowing the appointment of vakils* or native pleaders in the courts of civil judicature in three provinces-Bengal, Bihar and Orissa. After the 1857 mutiny, British Crown had taken over the rule of India from the East India Company, three High Courts were established in 1861 at Calcutta, Madras and Bombay.

At this time, three bodies of legal practitioners – advocates, attorneys and vakils* – were in existence. Advocates were the barristers of England or Ireland but the vakils were Indian practitioners. Legal Practitioners Act, 1879 provided the enrolments to only those practitioners who were taken LL.B. (Bachelor of Law) degree from Indian Universities. Bar Council Act, 1926 unified two grades of legal practitioners- the Vakils, and the pleaders, by merging them in a single class of advocates (Sharma, 1984). Thus, by this time the legal profession started to take a shape.

Formal legal education in India came into existence in 1855 through starting the LL.B. course in the colleges and universities of India with an aim to develop the human resources for the growing need of British administration to help the lower courts and the High Courts in the
administration of justice by enrolling themselves as vakils for or becoming judicial officers. Although a number of elite families preferred to send their family member to England for higher and legal education. In 1857, legal education was introduced as a subject in three universities in the Presidency towns of Calcutta, Madras and Bombay. In this period, the legal profession acquired a very high prestige in society as most of the leaders participated in National Freedom Movement of India were lawyers of very high prestige studied in England and practiced in India as well as abroad. Thus, in British period, Indian legal education and professions have taken a proper shape and a number of lawyers studied at England became the role model of Indian lawyers (Singh, 2003a, 2003b). This has helped in westernization of the legal profession in India.

In post-independence period, a number of lawyers became legislators and participated in making of Indian Constitution. A number of reforms were suggested by the Setalvad Commission in 1954 in the system of legal education: It was emphasized that only graduation should be eligible for legal studies; the theory and principle of law should be taught in the law school and the procedural law and the law of practical character should be taught by the Bar Council.

The university course should be for two years and the Bar Council training should be one year and All India Bar Council should be empowered to ascertain whether law college maintain the requisite minimum standards and should be empowered and should be refused recognition for the law Law colleges. It was only after the year 1961 that the Bar Council of India was empowered to lay down standards of legal education. In 1967 this body established a uniform three years LL.B. Course with an annual examination system (Singh and Roopa Rani 2014).

However there was a significant deterioration in the prestige of legal professionals in comparison to the other professionals, namely, scientist, doctors and engineers. It was because of the high demands of technical personals, doctors, engineers and scientists in first three decades after independence which made the people crazy for science education (Deepthi, 2007). While the association of the legal profession with the political class has deteriorated its prestige in society and it was chosen mainly by those having a graduation in art subjects or those who could not get admission in the subjects of science stream or by those who were aspired to join politics for their career.

Another factor responsible for this deterioration was the policy of a number of states governments particularly in the Hindi dominated states implemented the policy of imparting legal education in vernacular language while in the remaining states continued with English language as medium of instruction in law courses. Although, this change in these states has opened up the legal profession for those section of society who were excluded from the legal profession because of their social and economic background particularly those of rural and lower caste origin and helped in improvement of their socio-economic status but at the same time it also deteriorated the quality of legal education in these states.

In 1980s, the Indian government had made an attempt to modernize and improve the legal education as it was highly dissatisfied with the poor quality of Indian law schools especially when compared with India’s engineering and medical schools.
To rectify this situation, the government began creating a small numbers of very selective of National Law universities (NLUs) that would do for the legal profession what the Indian Institute of technology was already accomplishing for the engineering profession. These NLUs were expressly design to be centre of excellence, with an aim to train the graduates to be both technically competent and socially conscious and engaged. (Papa and Wilkins 2012: 14)

The advent of globalization in India proved a boon to these graduates as the overwhelming majority of them chosen their careers either in corporate law business or positions in large companies. Recently, a numbers of university departments and colleges have introduced a Five Years Integrated Degree Course in Law after completion of twelve years of schooling, keeping in view the growing demand of the corporate sector jobs in India. This Five Years Integrated Degree Course in Law is generally self-financing or with a high fee structure and taught invariably in English medium. The course contents have been thoroughly revised and updated to meet the demand of globalizing legal service market on the line of courses by NLUs.

However, at the same time, after completion of graduation in any stream, the conventional three-year LL.B. course is also run by the same department/college with a nominal fee structure, in vernacular medium with traditional course contents. Generally, students of rural backgrounds and with vernacular medium take admission in this course. They generally prefer to practice in districts courts where clients from rural areas come abundantly for their case work. These new developments have stratified the legal education in two strata not only in terms of social background of the students but also in making their professional choice there by creating a n elite stratum within the legal profession. It is in the light of above historical background that we can now focus on globalization of legal profession in India.

**Globalization of the Legal Profession in India**

A number of significant changes can be observed in the post-globalization period in the legal service sector. Areas like activities in project financing, intellectual property right protection, environmental protection, competitive law, corporate governance and investment law were almost unknown to Indian lawyers before 1990s. But now they are becoming the part of curriculum in new integrated courses and the conventional courses are also being revised although the ace is very slow in most of the universities.

Although, globalization has created the demand for corporate legal services in India, but it has not produced free trade in this sector of economy. Indian market remains closed for foreign law firms and lawyers despite India’s general open policy to multi-national corporations and foreign companies. But indirect presence of these firms can be seen in form of liaison offices or other informal means. At the same time, Indian corporate law firms have strengthened and expended in an impressive manner during last one decade.

The globalization of legal profession in India involves three important issues – the debate over the liberalization of legal services market; the actual competition between domestic and
foreign law firms notwithstanding formal barriers to entry; and India’s evolution as the major
centre for legal process outsourcing (LPO) (Papa and Wilkins, 2012).

In the early 1990s, Indian government granted liaison licenses to some foreign law firms which
enabled them to open their offices in India for liaison work, such as information gathering and
dissemination. However, these law firms faced the charges of exceeding the terms of their
licenses by engaging themselves in consultancy/legal services through their offices. In 2009,
none but Bombay High Court ruled out that the original grant of licenses to these foreign firms
had been done in violation to Indian law. The court has specifically pointed out the Advocates
Act of 1961 which regulates all legal practice in India and prohibits both litigation and non-
litigation work conducted by foreign lawyers even if the foreign lawyer in question has a degree
from an Indian law school and confines his or her work to issues relating to their “home
country” law.

This ruling made the Indian regulatory regime one of the most restrictive in the world for foreign
lawyers. This led to an active political debate between the advocates of liberalization in legal
services and those who oppose liberalization in legal service sector. The advocates of
liberalization argued that opening of market is beneficial for both the firms and the clients. With
an increase in the number of transnational deals, everyone will be benefitted; deregulation of
legal market will lead to overall professionalization of the industry, increase in efficiency, easy
and more and more access to foreign expertise and works; promote the in-country expertise
and retention of legal talent. Liberalization will further enable the clients to get a broader
selection of law firms to practice in India because Indian law firms may also practice in other
jurisdictions including the UK and the US (Papa and Wilkins, 2012). On the other hand, their
opponents argued that India’s legal profession has a unique harmony based on a well-
developed ethos, culture and tradition and a very noble heritage and it should not be treated
as a commodity. Their worry is that once foreign lawyers are allowed to practice, they would
undermine this ethos and interfere in the workings of the Indian legal system.

Apart from these normative concerns, there are other factors also which are behind this
opposition. One of these is that Indian law firms continue to face a number of regulatory
restrictions like limitations on partnership size, advertising, contingent fees, and partnership
with non-advocates. Therefore, they find themselves not very comfortable in competing with
foreign law firms and foreign lawyers as the foreign law firms are not subject to some or all of
these restrictions. Thus, it is a hard reality that the Indian legal market is closed to foreign firms
due to regulatory restrictions but the foreign law firms have already gained a foothold inside
India through a wide range of associations and other relationships with Indian firms. Many of
them actively work on India-related transactions from their London, Washington, Singapore or
Hong Kong offices (Russell, 2010). These firms have invariably an “India desk” that employees
a good number of lawyers from India’s top law schools, and their full-time jobs are to provide
services to their Indian clients and perform India-related transactions.

At the same time, Indian lawyers have also started to work on the conventional corporate
activities in last two decades. There has been tremendous growth in the number of lawyers
working on corporate legal activities both within corporate firms and as well as in-house legal
departments in India-based corporations. Furthermore, Indian legal firms have also started
venturing abroad to capitalize on the inflow and outflow of investment. Another important development in the legal profession of India, which can be observed in the last one decade, is the emergence of India as a major Legal Process Outsourcing (LPO) destination. Legal Process Outsourcing refers to “sending of legal work traditionally handled inside a company or firm to an outside contractor for performance” (Papa and Wilkins, 2012: 10).

LPO could be possible in India because of the disaggregation of legal services into separate component parts and sophisticated information technology. Indian Outsourcing firms charge very low rate (one-tenth to one-third) of what a traditional foreign firm charges per hour. It also saves time because their lawyers can focus on value added to the final product instead of routine works like electronic document management, and review, legal research and other menial tasks and they can also benefit from time zone differences, which makes 24-hour workflow possible.

There are a number of reasons for the dominant position of India in the LPO market. One of the factors responsible for the growth of LPO in legal services is that India has vast pool of educated, English-speaking lawyers and paralegals, and it utilizes a common law system, similar to the one practiced in the US, UK and the Australia (Papa and Wilkins, 2012). It suggests that outsourcing of legal services in India will not only contribute significantly in the process of economic development but also new employment opportunities to the young lawyers as it has already happened in case of information technology, pharmaceuticals and software development in the past two decades.

Conclusion

The legal profession has evolved during the British colonial in India. In its initial stage, only advocates of foreign origin mainly from England or Ireland were allowed to practice in Indian courts established by East India Company. The vakils or attorneys, who were of Indian origin, were, however, not allowed to appear in the courts. In this way the vakils or attorneys who constituted a large part of the legal profession at that time were having a sub-ordinate position and acted as agent/translator for their clients and provided the assistance to the English-speaking advocate (Sharma, 1984).

But gradually with the introduction of legal education in Indian universities and colleges in the second half of the nineteenth century, the lawyers of Indian origin joined as advocates and barristers in Indian legal profession and the sub-ordinate category of vakils and attorneys was merged with advocates. Thus, a uniform structure of legal profession emerged in India. It has helped in further growth of the legal profession and in the first half of the 20th century many youth of elitist family aspired to get legal education in England and joined the legal profession. In this period, the legal profession attained a high reputation in the society.

Again, when some eminent lawyers and barristers launched struggle for India’s freedom, the legal education and profession became the launching pad for the freedom struggle. This trend continued over a period of time even in the post-independent period. This can be termed as the expansion phase of legal profession in India. Three areas of legal practice can be identified in this period—civil, revenue and criminal. In the post-independent period, the legal profession was further diversified to new areas like income tax, sales tax, and litigations related to land
consolidation etc. This phase is also characterized as phase of diversification of legal profession.

The ‘parochialisation’ of the legal profession started with implementation of the policy aimed to provide legal education in vernacular languages so that people from all social classes can join the legal profession. As a result, the profession became more inclusive with the joining of the people of backward and scheduled castes, women and ruralites. However, it also resulted in deterioration of legal education and profession particularly in 1970s and 1980s and it has lost its prestige. In 1980s, the establishment of National Law Universities (NLUs) in different parts of the country was an attempt to modernize the legal profession and in bringing back its lost prestige.

This step became very productive in the post-globalization phase as most of the products of the NLUs were absorbed in highly paid corporate sector and MNCs due to the high quality of education imparted in these institutions. But the legal profession of India is highly restricted in the world as Advocate Act of 1961 restricts the foreign lawyers and firms to provide legal services in India. But despite this restriction the foreign legal firms and lawyers have penetrated the market of legal services in India although indirectly or through informal means. It has generated a debate among the Indian lawyers regarding the opening of legal service market and they are divided into two categories of pro-liberalization and anti-liberalization. Further, the legal education has been stratified into two strata: one of those having high quality of professional education (FYIDL) and those having a simple LL.B. degree after graduation.

These two strata differ from each other in terms of their socio-economic background, quality and contents of their professional training and consequently in their prospects in the profession. The growth of LPO in legal services in India has created new opportunities for young Indian lawyers. One of the important characteristic of globalization, its capacity of simultaneously excluding and including the people, activities and places (Castells, 2000; Singh, 2007), is confirmed in case of legal profession of India. It is including a small elitist section of the lawyers and they are getting maximum economic benefits from globalization of the profession while the others who don’t fit in its framework are being excluded by the forces of globalization. Thus, on the basis of above discussion, it can be concluded that the forces of globalization have made the legal education and profession in India not only segmented and stratified in terms of income, power and prestige but also simultaneously creating inclusion and exclusion in society.

Note
The term for a lawyer is ‘vakil’ which was also used in Muslim India in the sense of an agent or ambassador who represented his principal for varied reasons (see Misra, 1961: 162-63).

References


Singh, V. P. (2003a) Social Background and Occupational Mobility in Legal Profession, Emerging Trends in Development Research, 9 (1&2), 3-9

Singh, V. P. (2003b) Network, Education and Mobility in Legal Profession, Meerut: ETDR Publication


Contact address
Virendra P. Singh
Centre for Globalization and Development Studies
University of Allahabad
Allahabad-211002
India
Email: etdryps@gmail.com
Knowledge is gaining currency in the globalized capitalism and higher education is increasingly turning into a market place (Hermo and Pittelli, 2011, 2008; Hermo, 2011, 2008). These trends can be observed in various fields of professional work, in public administration and in enterprise as well as in academia and technology. Within this context, the postgraduate degree is becoming relevant as both a certification of advanced competences of an individual professional and a process of knowledge production of a professional group.

Previous studies have noted that one of the consequences of this growing demand for higher education has in many cases created a mismatch between demand and supply, the latter one lagging behind and thus creating a gap. This situation, together with technological changes and new developments in information and communication technologies (ICT’s), has boosted the development of transnational offers from higher education in all segments (Didou Aupetit, 2005), but especially in the area of professional training and postgraduate studies.

This process allows expanding the demand. Since there are such new academic offers, people who had not arisen access courses or university degrees because they had no alternatives or schedules appropriate to their scope and possibilities, from these facilities think of doing it. This new situation is possible because distance education develops virtual education platforms: it allows solving both problems of transfers as of schedules, facilitating access to educational offers. If students may be physically in various locations other than where the institution of higher education has its actual basis, the same goes for those who design and diagram courses, supervise them, dictating them - when it is and this is the case – and act as tutors in them. This paves the way for a transformation of the specific intellectual work of University teaching, as it had existed while teaching was only in the classroom or self-assisted, as it was the case of the distance education in its beginnings – with shipments of materials by mail.

Thus, it starts a new era of global professors with substantially different conditions from the prevailing work in the same universities for those who are at current classroom tasks. Without doubt, the precariousness of employment is one of the expected consequences of such a mutation. This does not mean that increasing precariousness in the institutions of higher education is only heritage of this new type of globalized professors, since there are multiple forms of term contracts and others, also in the traditional classroom work. In the specific segment of continuous teachers and professors training and the specialization in management and administration of education, there is also a significant demand linked to the difficulties involved to provide appropriate options in most education systems. Such kind of problems are more noticeable for the professional development of managers and supervisors of the education system, given that it is difficult to remove them for a long period of their responsibilities without resenting the quality and efficiency of the systems in which they work.
All these reasons combined are explaining, in good measure, why the Organization of Ibero-American States for Education, Science and Culture (OEI) decided to make the Course of University Expert in Administration of Education (CADE), directed specifically to managers and supervisors of education systems from Latin American countries. It was decided to entrust the development of this course at an institution with a wide experience in distance and virtual education: Universidad Nacional de Educación a Distancia (UNED) of Spain. Although this institution has a stable body of professors-tutors, some of whom were involved in this new course, it was necessary (and the decision, was also taken) to incorporate new tutors. The development of this experience will be the case study taken as the basis for the analysis developed in this work.

A brief about CADE

The countries that are members of the OEI are Argentina, Bolivia, Brazil, Colombia, Costa Rica, Cuba, Chile, Dominican Republic, Ecuador, El Salvador, Spain, Guatemala, Equatorial Guinea, Honduras, Mexico, Nicaragua, Panama, Paraguay, Peru, Portugal, Puerto Rico, Uruguay and Venezuela. They are represented in this organism by the respective Ministries of Education, who are responsible for promoting every year the CADE and select participants among applicants, given that there are a limited number of vacancies and the course was entirely sponsored by OEI.

CADE had a presence stage which lasted from 1985 until 2003. In those times, the candidates selected and approved moved to Spain for a period lasting the course (about a month), being released of their duties and all costs of transportation and accommodation payments. Since 2004, it moved to online mode, which is the matter that will be analyzed here. The first effect of this was the extension of the period of training – and therefore the contents – up to ten months. This experience of the virtual course, which began as an experimental model, was developed in seven annual editions, until the end of 2012. It was an update and improvement system planned for officers of the education systems of Iberian-American countries (only from the American area, not Iberian) selected by the respective Ministries of Education. On the contrary, all professors, tutors and those who diagrammed and updated its contents as well as the coordination of the CADE, were selected by the UNED.

The case and its usefulness to the raised question

Beyond the description, this case is similar to many others. On the one hand, because they make possible to contact people in different roles that they interact on different occasions, as a general characteristic of any course of distance education in Internet times with available virtual platforms. On the other hand, because when it comes to content linked to different countries or regions, as opposed to a classroom course that boasts mostly University professors where it dictates (though you may occasionally receive visiting professors from other countries), the possible interaction with these tools includes – at least potentially – the possibility of having enrichment of the experience from the inclusion therein of participants and from professors of the different areas that in the course they are studying.

Thus, in the case of the CADE, have gone from a classroom course – taught in Spain, only by Spaniard professors although being, primarily, of issues related to Latin America – to one of
longer duration, without uprooting of the environment in which each participant develops his or her task and, with a higher proportion of content developed by Latin American professors and increased presence of these as being responsible for the tutorials. It had meant a better approach to a better understanding of the gaze on the region and the problems to be solved in Latin American education, specifically. This is an interesting possibility that open these new modalities of distance interaction (to use a larger concept than the virtual education) and adds possibilities of siding experiences and developments in different locations than that in which is located the institution of higher education that dictates the course.

What it is necessary to remember now is that those who dictate courses in normal classrooms in the universities are professors who have an employment relationship below a legal mandatory regime in each country or each institution's own. This has been the historical case of the typical relationship that connects professors with universities, whether in a permanent way and, usually, in some kind of wage regime – with all that this implies in formal terms and contractual relationship between the parties – or so transient to dictate just a matter or course and has governed in most cases by regulations that are valid for this types of temporary jobs (for example, forward contracts).

This is a crucial point which seeks to illustrate with the developed case: which new types of labour relations imply the emergence of new relations between parties which are not governed by the same rules, since they are in different countries? Considering such situation implies to assume the obvious: University professors are workers ruled by labour relationship as in any other employer-employee case. This does not mean not to recognize the particularities of intellectual work that involves the university teaching. However, this should not disguise the fact that it is a situation of buying and selling of work force as any other in the capitalist system.

The difference between the modes of permanent and temporary or interim contracts is often given by the category of the work carried out inside the University. In the first case, there is usually some sort of contest involving income system to teaching or a default period – such in Argentina, which is every seven years for teachers- or on a permanent basis when there is some kind of regular professor career. In the second case, the interim contractual modalities, can be to meet temporary needs, either because competitions have not been substantiated or similar in the area which is needed to cover the position, either because it is in novel situations that is not yet known how they will evolve and what will be the permanent positions to be created then, which is the case of new careers, programs or departments.

Of course, there are innumerable differences between countries and what has just been said, applies in the majority of cases for public universities, being much more varied the case of private universities, particularly in Latin America. These clarifications are necessary, because working in university teaching is ruled according to meritocratic criteria, which hide the wage relationship behind a complex system to evaluate the merits, the scientific production and the career of each professor. It is clear that it is an intellectual work, which can be described perfectly within the immaterial labour category (Hardt and Negri, 2002) and that this involves special care not to fall into a simplification with regard to the type of wage relationship established.
These contractual arrangements described above are not applied randomly. The classical indefinite permanent wage labour is often linked to teaching performances involving responsibilities in the undergraduate degree and research, although it can also include teaching responsibilities in postgraduate. In addition, to the two types of wage relations raised so far, contractual arrangements there are also even more precarious conditions of work which involve the payment of fees linked to the performed task and covering only the time which lasts.

This last situation differs from the other temporary or interim contracts in which, in the majority of cases, the relationship established is to assimilate the tasks of teaching and others that could involve hiring, with the provision of a "professional service", which is paid according to a scale set by the university (and therefore non-negotiable in most cases, which put it away from a real professional service). When this situation happens within the national scope, it usually required the emission of some sort of receipt or invoice by the hired professor as a step previous or simultaneous to the payment of fees agreed to by the provision of "service", altering the logic of the other usual contractual relationships in which the employer issues a receipt (usually a salary receipt) that is given to the employee along with the payment of their salary.

In the case of the CADE at UNED, which here is being developed, it should be present that there are national workers (Spaniards) and non-nationals playing the same task at the same time, in a field not ruled by national regulations (at least not completely). What have been done in this case, as in many others, is to work with this last contractual modality, which assimilates the labour of University teaching to the provision of a service and pay at the end of it (in this case, the task performed in each module of the previously mentioned) the total of the fees for the same, established as a sum of money to a work week that includes ten hours of work, at least in theory. As modules have a known period of weeks, and the task is measured almost by the accompaniment that is made to the work developed by the participants in the course, it is possible to modulate the work performed by each tutor.

**Conclusions**

The developments illustrate an emergent new kind of transnational worker, who is highly qualified and plays an important role in the new global scenario. It is, also, a new twist on outsourcing of staff, which is now available – increasingly – in a globalized labour market, especially in the sector of high specialization. The example presented here highlights this situation in the specific field of virtual education and online learning platforms providing today to integrate students and teachers of different nationalities, located in different geographical locations and possibilities that connect at various and different times. But the interesting thing about the case is that this situation also arises in many other professions and that begins to arise a new scenario of job insecurity, which is pushed by growing competition among highly skilled workers, who previously could only compete against each other if they lived in the same geographical area as the contracting entity.

The financial sector, pioneer in economic globalization and true engine of development and growing importance of ICT’s in a globalized economy, is a clear example of how new sectors of workers bound together by the financial markets and the agents operating in them can be
employed. There are situations in which permanent employees of banks, stock exchange and other financial institutions, agents coexist with "consultants" part-time, "free-lance" agents and independent professionals – among other modalities – which may be operating in line on a permanent basis and that, like simple elements, can be easily replaced as with any node in a network.

Also in the software industry has been seen how there has been one greater tendency to hire companies and individuals of high rating for lower wages without having to move from their habitual residence. This means the type of immaterial production that many companies in the computer industry have been allowed to outsource part of the work necessary for the production, using teleworkers – usually from the formerly so called third world – or companies that subcontract them, allowing a reduction in costs, reducing liability and helping to dismantle the highly qualified work.

This same situation occurs in increasingly more economic sectors: most of them in services sectors and of immaterial labour in general, where is possible to work through distance. From construction to medical diagnosis, all work involving highly specialized manipulation of symbols and symbolic analysis (Reich, 1993), is possible to be outsourced and, in many cases, locked in competition in emerging global markets. However, this is a new kind of competition between highly skilled workers, most transient, that are provided according to varying needs who require these intangible highly skilled workers.

The fact that the professors of this course were other university professors – workers with high qualifications – is also related to these transformations of the transnational work with the changes imposed by globalization, with increasing competition between ‘highly qualified human resources’ (so far we have avoided the use of this terminology because equating humans with resources constitutes a definition with which we do not agree, but could not avoid a reference to the usual terminology in the business and management world, which often are transferred uncritically to the intellectual and educational field) and with the increasing precariousness of labour relations resulting from all this.

References


Contact address
Javier Pablo Hermo
Universidad de Buenos Aires
Argentina
Email: jphoono@gmail.com
Case Study: Russia

Professionalization of Social Work in Russia: Recent Developments

Elena Iarskaia-Smirnova and Valentina Yarskaya, Moscow, Russia

The years of 1990s-2000s have been remarkable for the development of social work as a new occupation in Russia, and the research in this domain was conducted in frameworks of sociology of profession. In the process of adopting a new concept into the spheres of professional training and practice, different value systems counteract and often contradict each other. This constitutes an important area for research of professional development of social work in today’s Russia.

Reflections on the fast development of social work as a profession in Russia have been conducted over the last twelve years (Iarskaia-Smirnova 1999; Penn 2007; Ramon, 1998; Shanin 1998; Schmidt, 2009; Templeman 2004). In 1990s. Russia, as many other postcommunist societies experienced the serious worsening of welfare indicators, the depths of distress, including evidence on declining life expectancy, rising morbidity, the erosion of schooling, lack of social protection and mass unemployment (Standing 1998), increases in poverty (Cook 2007: 3). Russia inherited from the Soviet period a complex system of social security based in public institutions, without professional social work and with the small social transfers to different social groups (people with disabilities, single mothers, veterans, etc., altogether more than 150 categories of population), which were in addition irregularly paid.

It was evident that previous social institutions could not cope with these new social problems. The broad social-policy strategies have attempted to manage both the legacy of social problems from the past and the new social costs of transition (Deacon 2000). During the 1990s a wide network of social services were established under the responsibility of the Ministry of Labor and Social Development (recently Ministry of Health Care and Social Development). The network of social work agencies was growing simultaneously with a number of universities offering professional education in social work that become an extremely popular choice for young people. However, a contradictory situation is in place: due to a low wages the majority of graduates leave the profession once they have got their diploma, therefore, unqualified social carers still make up the majority of the workforce (Penn 2007).

Since the beginning of the 1990s the practice field of social work was developing rather separately from the field of professional training, while the situation in human resources of the social work services sector was characterized by low wages, labour shortage, high fluctuation of personnel and insufficient opportunities of retraining. The research shows that, by setting up inadequate wage policies for social workers, the state has reinforced the societal assumption of cheap women’s labour as well as the lack of professionalisation of social work. Dissatisfaction with low wages and medicalized treatment of social problems were the key notions in social workers discourse in the 1990s (Iarskaia-Smirnova and Romanov 2002).

A contradictory situation was revealed: due to a low wages the majority of graduates leave the profession once they have got their diploma, therefore, unqualified social carers still make up
the majority of the workforce (Penn 2007, Iarskaia-Smirnova and Romanov 2002). The main characteristics of the development of social services in today’s Russia were mentioned in the publications: lack of standards of services, weak knowledge base concerning the methods of working with clients and standard regulation in this field, lack of skills in evaluation of quality and effectiveness by many public and non-governmental organizations, as well as knowledge of how to be competitive to promote good services, organizations and methods of work (Romanov 2008); informalization and corruption of social sectors, shadow processes of distribution developed among state elites (Cook 2007: 10).

During the last few years some experiments have taken place in this area, primarily in those fields supported by international foundations and expert groups. These innovations were directed towards increasing the effectiveness of social services as well as their management, with a great emphasis on measurable outcomes. Although the potential exists for all types of social services to participate in the process of budgeting in the framework of the so-called quasi-market processes, this process in Russia is limited by a lack of standardisation of services, a weak knowledge base concerning the methods of working with clients and standard regulation in this field, a shortage of skills in evaluating quality and effectiveness by many public organisations and NGOs, as well as a lack of knowledge of how to be competitive to promote good services, organisations and methods of work.

The ongoing processes of social policy reforms in Russia are determined by the neoliberal principles to restructure the inherited welfare state by reducing subsidies and entitlements, introducing means testing and privatization (Cook 2009: 2). This shift to a market welfare system had been legitimized by the emphasis on increase in transparency of the system of social services in order to manage and optimize the distribution of budget resources. While in the West an increase in commodification and raise of individualism is explained due to a crisis of the welfare state, in Russia these processes are caused by the fall of socialism and expanding of market reforms (Lokshin and Popkin 1999).

As the standard of living decreased during market reforms in Russia, the pressure on the social welfare system increased considerably. Due to the costliness and ineffectiveness of universalistic approaches, means-tested schemes became the dominant form of social support. That has led to a decrease in the number of groups eligible for welfare, and recently to the introduction of monetary benefits instead of social services and privileges (such as free public transport and reduced fees for communal services).

The process of social policy liberalization in contemporary Russia is characterized by this shift to a market welfare system and the use of means-testing in the distribution of welfare and social support. The system of means-tested assistance now depends, more than before, on social workers to determine the degree of need and reliability of the clients’ applications. The procedures and techniques for checking “neediness” are not fully defined; nor are they or the legal status of such procedures clearly described. Thus this process was given to executors guided in this area by everyday life definitions, stereotypes, and informal organizational norms within the welfare services. Although means-tested assistance was supposed to increase the effectiveness of the social welfare system, it nevertheless has negative effects on the most vulnerable parts of the population, especially women with small children.
The experiences of social workers and their clients demonstrate that single mothers are stigmatized as clients whose claims to social rights may be invalidated by professional experts. As a result, because social work is trapped in existing stereotypes, rules of justification, and patterns of behavior, it helps sustain inequality in society. The discourses examined in the practice of social work with single mothers reflect the fact that some categories of people are perceived as “worthy” of social rights, while others are not. This idea is being internalized and legitimized by both sides of the social worker-client relationship (Iarskaia-Smirnova and Romanov 2012b). Sätre (2014) considers how Russian social work can have an empowering effect on people living in poverty: she comments on the low level of support provided by both state and NGO sectors; the factors which prevent their collaboration; and the formal and informal roles which women fulfil in local communities.

During 1990s and early 2000s a number of international donors have contributed to the development of higher education in Russia. International effects on social work education in Russia are noticed at several levels: institutional, systemic, curricular, symbolic and individual (Iarskaia-Smirnova 2011). Romanov and Kononenko (2014) discuss the impact of international trends in social work on Russian developments and raise the question of whether Russian practitioners can contribute to the global professional agenda while also adapting ideas for national application; they consider the role of various actors including international organizations, foreign partners, the Church and mass media in the development of social work methods and its value base. Some research also claims that there is a beginning acknowledgement of the need for inclusive policies in services (Antonova, 2014; Karpova and Vorona 2014).

Recent changes in Russian social services of the 2000s depicted in research include a rise of a third sector, a concern with social work professionalization, and the development of the new managerialism (Romanov 2008). The general modernization of the system of social welfare in Russia is an ongoing process nowadays and it has had a contradictory effect on social work ideology (Iarskaia-Smirnova 2011). While the Soviet state socialized many costs of motherhood and care work, nowadays families are bearing much heavier costs; women are more familialized, more dependent on family relationships (Pascall and Manning 2000).

Hence, modern social service ideologies are interconnected with dominant thinking on gender and social order (Iarskaia-Smirnova 2004; Iarskaia-Smirnova and Romanov 2008; Johnson 2009, Jäppinen 2011). The problems of a client might be an outcome of beliefs in traditional gender roles and traditional family definitions, which supposes inequality and subordination of women. In contrast to state-based services, non-governmental organizations, such as crisis centres for women, have developed a strong emancipatory view based on feminist ideology (Johnson 2009, Jäppinen 2011). Currently, a new understanding is emerging that highlights the need for a state response to the various forms of violence against women (Johnson 2009, Jäppinen 2011). Hawkins and Knox (2014) address more specifically the status of women in Russian society and suggest that gender violence is beginning to be viewed as a societal problem rather than being simply a ‘family matter’.
Having engaged in interactions with the social service system in the late 1990s to early 2000s, single parents were often frustrated by the inadequate assistance and impossibility to improve their life situations. Single parents families in public discourses and everyday life conversations often fall under the category of ‘unfit’ or ‘unfortunate’ (neblagopoluchnye), inherited from the late Soviet period. The discursive means are important components of a context in which clients understand their personal life situation in respect to the existing system of support and social workers create their own understanding of social problems. Institutions of welfare endorse social control over the capacities of single mothers to resist stigma (Iarskaia-Smirnova and Romanov 2012a). If social work education is to be truly committed to social justice and self-determination, it needs to critically review the gender ideology embedded in its knowledge base as well as liberate the knowledge of groups with which it works.

Public discourse which frames social work practice contains a mixture of stereotypes concerning social issues and their treatment inherited from Soviet times and induced by neoliberal ideology. The discourse on ‘unfortunate families’ appears to be a significant and powerful actor in neo-liberal welfare regime. Single parent households in today’s Russia are often depicted as immoral, unfortunate and dangerous not only for their own children but also for society on the whole. Single mothers are presented from the point of view of such patriarchal ideology even in a special literature for social workers (Iarskaia-Smirnova and Romanov 2008).

Everyday knowledge – ‘tacit knowledge’ that is not necessarily expressed verbally but must be experienced – plays an important role in practitioners’ work. In a context of anti-crisis efforts of the officials to improve social services with less budget the jargon words such as ‘unfortunate families’ reflect the policy of rationalizing of expenses (Iarskaia-Smirnova and Romanov 2012a). The contemporary situation in social work in Russia is featured by under-professionalization and therefore low degree of professional autonomy, as well as lack of activism frames in social services culture, absence of critical reflection of social work practice, and rigidity of governance (Iarskaia-Smirnova and Romanov 2013). This is a background where the initiatives to change the existing social order can hardly be seen.

However, recently there is some evidence that local initiatives can initiate transformation of the social work and social policy system. Social workers are gradually acquiring new knowledge and skills to effect social change in a democratic egalitarian mode rather than following a paternalist scheme of thought and action. This is still the exception rather than usual practice. The contemporary situation in Russian social work is featured by under-professionalisation and therefore a low degree of professional autonomy, as well as a lack of activism frameworks in the social services culture, an absence of critical reflection on social work practice, and the rigidity of governance.

This is a background that tends to stifle initiatives to change the existing social order. However, recent evidence that local initiatives can bring about a transformation of the social work and social policy system has emerged. Case studies (Iarskaia-Smirnova and Romanov 2013) present mechanisms of changes evoked through counter-actions and compromises, individual activity or collective action, consolidation with social movements and other agents, through
the implementation of new methods and forms of casework in the system of social services, or through the lobbying of legislative changes and the practice of institutionalised forms of conflict resolution in courts. Strategies for promoting social change, agents of change and institutional barriers are discussed in the theoretical context of professionalism as a value system and ideology. As one can see, capacity to promote social initiatives vary at different levels of the organisational hierarchy, while the professional autonomy of specialists is very limited.

Several cases in our research exemplify such exceptions when the initiatives of social workers have led to structural changes. Social workers initiate positive changes through counter-actions and compromises, individual activity or collective action, consolidation with social movements and other agents, through implementing fundamentally new methods of casework into the system of social services or through the practice of institutionalised forms of conflict resolution.

Iarskaia-Smirnova and Rasell (2014) analyse why education in universities is still so disconnected from the field of social work practice. They focus on institutional dynamics that shape the national regulation of social work education, limited practice content in curricula and the mixed impact of international co-operation. The research highlights that achieving broad agreement on the need for practice skills, service user prioritization and a strong values base must be the key focus when developing training in contexts where social work is relatively new. As it is shown, somewhat paradoxically, the expansion of social work training in Russian universities has not necessarily been positive for the actual profession in terms of disseminating vocationally useful knowledge, values and skills. Degree programmes could contribute far more to Russia’s welfare sphere if redesigned to meet practice realities, particularly now that social work is supposedly a political priority. Enhancing the capabilities of Russian practitioners would help to mitigate the absence of national frameworks and professional guidelines for tackling deprivation and raising well-being.

A stronger professional identity and skills level would also move the image of social work away from basic care and benefits to empowerment, innovation and fighting oppression. It is clear that social work education in Russia is affected by the weak status of the profession in addition to vagaries in the higher education system, requiring changes in both the welfare and university sectors to promote professionalization. However, the firm basis of social work education in academia means that that students and staff potentially have solid tools for developing the profession’s evidence base and analytical stance, including possible doctoral programmes. Overall awareness of social work’s goals, methods and values is stronger now among Russian academics than in the last two decades, especially in terms of fighting discrimination and marginalization. These strengths should be promoted so that Russian social work education contributes to the crucial task of supporting vulnerable people in a country where safety nets and well-being remain fragile.

In summer 2013, occupational standards for a range of professions, including social work, were being developed by groups of experts supported by the federal Ministry of Labour and Social Protection. Separate standards were commissioned for ‘social work specialists’ and ‘social workers’ and they could increase the professional orientation of future educational
curricula, especially if plans to introduce vocational degrees in addition to traditional academic programmes are realized. These documents are admittedly being written by the same structures currently regulating social work degrees.

Yet, institutional agendas are never static and the work on occupational standards may shift official understandings of social work education in Russia. There are therefore cautious grounds for optimism that the traditionally limited role for practice and professional skills associated with the rapid growth of social work training in the country can be overcome. Ultimately, social work education could enhance the status, influence and voice of social work in Russia by giving graduates a distinctive value base, professional orientation and shared identity (Iarskaia-Smirnova and Rasell, 2014; Romanov and Iarskaia-Smirnova 2014).

References
Iarskaia-Smirnova E., Romanov P. (2012a) Doing class in social welfare discourses: ‘unfortunate families’ in Russia, Suvi Salmenniemi (ed) Rethinking class in Russia. Farnham: Ashgate: 85-105


Contact address
Elena Iarskaia-Smirnova
Moscow, Russia
Email: elena.iarskaia@socpolicy.ru
Case Study: Turkey

Sociology of Professions in a World Perspective: Governing the Turkish Medical Profession in a New Healthcare System

Tuba I. Agarta, Providence College, Providence, USA

This statement argues that Turkish health reform experience can make important contributions to the study of professions. The analysis of the relationship between these reforms and the medical profession provides new insights in the professions and professionalism in middle-income countries without mature welfare systems.

There is a new economic and social context of medicine in Turkey, which is marked with marketization, consumerism and managerialism. Since the early 1990s, reforms expanded the role of private sector in service provision and introduced outsourcing and performance management in public hospitals. The most recent reform initiative, the Health Transformation Program (HTP), which was carried out systematically since 2003, builds on these earlier reform initiatives. On the one hand, the HTP created a single-payer system by uniting the four public insurance funds, introduced a standard benefits package and expanded public insurance coverage.

On the other hand, it introduced a purchaser-provider split, expanded private provision, adopted new payment mechanisms that emphasize performance, granted public hospitals some degree of autonomy, and redefined the Ministry of Health as a planning and supervising authority (MoH 2003; OECD 2008). Similar to health reform initiatives in many advanced industrialized countries, improving efficiency and effectiveness of health care delivery was assigned a high priority and new quality standards that were tied to performance payments were implemented in all hospitals. Thus, market elements were combined with managerialism and expanded the audit and inspection regimes.

Clearly the interest in the Turkish case is growing, however, most of the recent publications focused on the process and effects of the reform (Baris et al. 2011) public perceptions (Ali Jadoo Alazawi et al. 2014) and/or outcomes for access, cost and quality (Agartan 2012; Hamzaoglu et al. 2014; Yardim et al. 2014). Some recent publications examine the reforms in the hospital sector (Sahin 2014) as well as their impacts on health professions such as nurses (Harmanci and Yildirim 2013) or family doctors (Ocek et al. 2014), although little attention has hitherto focused on the medical profession. This finding is quite striking when one considers the extent to which the impacts of marketization and managerialism have been examined, in the sociology of professions literature, with respect to their relationship to the third logic – professionalism.

This literature, which focuses largely on industrialized countries, has demonstrated that a major transformation in the relationship among the three logics – consumerism/marketization, managerialism and professionalism – has been taking place. The first two of these forces have been strengthening due to broader changes such as the welfare state crisis in advanced industrialized countries (Harrison and Ahmad 2000; Numerato et. al. 2012), shifts in ideology.
(rise of neoconservatism), technological changes which may be used to increase surveillance
power of the bureaucracy while empowering the patients who are more knowledgeable and
demanding (Light and Levine 1988). In this context, the language in the governance of health care changed significantly: increasing efficiency and effectiveness emerged as priority goals; concern for accountability and transparency grew; competition and choice was promoted; and patients were increasingly seen as consumers of health care (Dent 2005; Kuhlmann and Burau 2008). The influence of the new public management (NPM) movement was also crucial with its emphasis on incorporating private logic into public institutions. In many industrialized countries, the autonomous and restrictive practices of the professions were seen as interfering with free competition, which was expected to improve efficiency, increase choice, and enhance quality.

While retaining the idea of conflict and hegemony between the two logics of managerialism and professionalism, recent studies have moved beyond the dichotomy, and adopted a more dynamic understanding that explored how physicians respond to growing managerial control and imposition of managerial values and language by “co-opting, adapting and circumventing” (Waring and Currie 2009). Depending on the particular context, this process may involve various degrees and mixes of internalizing of the counter logic, resistance, adaptation, and co-operation that may end up transforming both the identity of the professionals and the nature of managerial tools they are using.

Another important argument highlighted in these recent studies was the variability of professional practice in specific contexts (Kuhlmann et. al. 2013; Waring and Currie 2009). “Similar” policy ideas – such as evidence-based medicine or incident reporting systems – that were adopted as part of these managerial reforms might indeed have quite different outcomes depending on the nature of healthcare system, the relative power and autonomy of social actors such as the medical profession, unions, bureaucracy, etc., state traditions, ideology and goals of reformers, and how these actors interpreted these policy ideas.

I believe such a complex, dynamic and contextualized approach offers new opportunities to analyze changes in professionalism outside of the industrialized countries. Reforms in middle-income countries such as Turkey or Mexico combine elements of marketization, managerialism and universalism largely because reforms have to address problems of access to healthcare services and lack of insurance coverage. This is an important difference in the nature of the reforms in countries without mature welfare systems that can be described with a term borrowed from the development studies - “leapfrogging”: middle-income countries do not simply follow the development trajectories of the mature healthcare systems but adopt reforms that help them “leapfrog” in their own paths, thus learning from the experiences of industrialized countries and skipping some of the steps such as the welfare state crisis.

Managerialism, marketization and consumerism seem to offer attractive solutions to policymakers in these contexts, and reform initiatives rely on and benefit from technological changes such as electronic information systems or performance management systems. Future studies in this area can fill a void in the sociology of the professions literature by exploring how these three logics are defined in middle-income countries, which policy ideas...
and tools were adopted, and how the social actors reacted to these reforms.

To conclude with the Turkish case, it would be very interesting to explore the relationships among managerialism and professionalism building on the dynamic perspective developed within the framework of sociology of professions: Are they counterforces or twin forces? How about doctors’ involvement in management: Does this serve as a means for weakening of medical dominance and erosion of professionalism or does it help extend medical dominance?

So far, the Turkish Medical Association (TMA) believes that the particular combination of managerial and market-based reforms have undermined their professional autonomy. The leaders of the TMA were especially worried about the antagonistic discourse of the reformers that portrayed the TMA as a self-interested actor who only cared about doctors’ professional rights, privileges, and autonomy. On the other hand, there is an explosion in the number of certificate and graduate programs for doctors who would like to fill the newly created managerial positions, and there is a growing interest in evidence-based medicine. We need comparative analyses and case studies to answer these questions and develop a more nuanced understanding of reforms and their consequences in middle-income countries.

References


Harmanci, SAK. and Yildirim, A. Nurses’ perceptions about health sector privatization in Turkey. International Nursing Review 60 (3) 2013: 320-7.


Kuhlmann E. and Burau V. The ‘Healthcare State’ in Transition. European Societies 10(4) 2008: 619-633


Sahin, A.A. The key to health services in Turkey: New perspectives on leadership and hospital management. *World Hospitals and Health Services* 50 (1) 2014:7.


Contact address

Tuba I. Agartan
Providence College, Health Policy and Management Program
1 Cunningham Square, Providence, RI
02918 USA

tagartan@providence.edu
The reference points for investigating the professions are well defined through culture (Anglo-American), occupation (medicine) and epoch (focus on the early twentieth century) (Crompton, 1990). Freidson (1994) goes as far as to paraphrase the ‘Anglo-American disease’. By now, however, the professional world has added many more entry points into the professions: More cultures aim at professionalism (Kuhlmann, 2013), more occupations claim to be professions (Evetts, 2003) and the modern era is a professional period (Goode, 1960).

The term ‘professional’ in all its variations has advanced triumphantly over the last century. It crossed sub-cultural borders in that it encroached from academic sophistication into mainstream vernacular (Carr-Saunders and Wilson, 1933). It crossed cultural borders in that it is being adopted by foreign languages, i.e. German (Kunczik and Zippel, 2001); it crossed occupational borders in that non-archetypal activities claim ‘professionalism’, reaching as far as begging in Russia (Solovyev, 2013). With this successful march through cultures, applications and epochs, one wonders what professionalism means today. In the Arab world, little is known about the professions, for instance an insight Reid (1974) allowed into the trait of associations in Egypt, and Krause’s (2001) ‘professional group power’.

Given this scarcity of inquiry into the subject, a pilot study was conducted in Jordan in November 2012, aimed at exploring whether the issue resonates at all in the Arab world. Eleven respondents from five Arab countries (Jordan, Tunisia, Iraq, Syria, Egypt-UK) were interviewed face-to-face by the author, administering a questionnaire which was derived from the theory of the professions. The collected data included translations of the term professionalism into Arabic, descriptions of its meaning, characteristics of Arab professionalism and assessments on whether a specific Arab professionalism exists. In addition, respondents were requested to assess the relevance of selected traits – association, autonomy, certification, clients, ethics, knowledge, quality of work, remuneration, service, symbolic rewards. This inquiry is framed by journalism education. The analysis was based on the MAXQDA software.

Regarding the term professionalism, most respondents suggested mehaneya or مهنية, others mohtaref or محترف. Scholars in Egypt, Morocco and Qatar were asked to elaborate on the terms. Appreciating the wealth of the Arabic language and emphasizing the novelty of the query, this paper suggests two Arabic terms for the notion of professionalism. The first is based on the three-letter-root m-h-n مهنة and in this respect, mehaneya or مهنية stands for professionalism; the second is based on the three-letter-root h-r-f حرف and in this respect, mohtaref or محترف translates as competent or skillful. In another distinction, mehna مهنة often refers to white collar occupations, while herfa حرفة often refers to blue collar occupations and the crafts.
However, overlapping areas of meaning exist, which may be the reason for some confusion—and contradiction—in the perception of the terms. Another reason for some incongruence may be caused by varying traditions in different parts of the Arab world. A third potential explanation is that the term is increasingly being used to explain modern occupational contexts (even though mehaneya can be traced back hundreds of years). One respondent recalls that the term was not as prevalent two, three decades ago as it is now.

Notwithstanding whether the respondents lean towards mehna or herfa, they correlate the concepts to a variety of values, including:

- Employment: work; provides for a living; contrary to the amateur;
- Education: academic qualification; knowledge; university degree;
- Practical qualification: training; work experience; expertise; skills;
- Continuous learning;
- Ethics: honesty; integrity; confidentiality; decency;
- Structure of professional performance: rules;
- Trust: faith; respect for clients and clients’ respect for the professional; reliability; confidence;
- Truthfulness;
- Quality of work: excellence in performing; perfection, ideal form of professional behavior; correct and accurate implementation; success;
- Remuneration vs. altruism;
- Individual preconditions: love and passion for the work; talent;
- Public service: social responsibility; many people are affected by work results;
- Autonomy: professional is held accountable for work results; objectivity; and
- The people: sociologically known as clients.

Acknowledging the decades long debate on the preeminent theoretical framework in the Sociology of Professions and appreciating that the traits approach has, in the view of some scholars, been put to rest (Aldridge and Evetts, 2003), while others encourage its application (Burns, 2007), it is noteworthy that Arab respondents propose professional values that strikingly resemble those of the functional debates. Some of the few traits missing in the above synopsis is the bonding of professionals in associations, and, when including the imperative trait of the professional project: control, monopoly.

There was a broad agreement among respondents insisting that professionalism is a universal value and a goal worth striving for in Arab professional contexts. As one respondent phrased it: ‘Professionalism is professionalism. Anywhere’. The findings of the pilot study in Jordan justify a broader study, which is currently underway as a PhD project at TU University Dortmund, Germany, supervised by Prof. Susanne Fengler.

References


Barber, B. (1963) Some Problems in the Sociology of the Professions, Daedalus, Journal of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences, 92 (4), 669-688


Information on the interviews

Eldin, Osama Mohy, Professor of the origins of the Arab Language, Faculty of Arabic Language, Al Azhar University, Cairo. Interview conducted by the author face-to-face on 21 October 2014, with simultaneous translation by Omar Rabie, Cairo University, Cairo, Egypt. The recorded audio file was translated by Menna Nefeily, Cairo University, Cairo, Egypt

Benhaddou, Mohamed, Professor of Translation and Text Linguistics at King Fahd Advanced School of Translation, Tangier, Morocco. Interview conducted by the author face-to-face on 16 November 2013. The recorded audio file was translated by Menna Nefeily, Cairo University, Cairo, Egypt

Hesham, Norhan, Teaching Assistant, Cairo University, Mass Communication Faculty, English Department, Cairo. Interview conducted face-to-face by the author on 13 October 2014.

Soleiman, Amani, Arab Journalist and Communications Consultant, UNESCO Iraq, Amman, Jordan. Interview conducted by the author face-to-face on 17 September 2012.

Zweiri, Mahjoob, Associate Professor in Contemporary History of the Middle East, Head of Department of Humanities, Qatar University, Doha, Qatar. Interview conducted by the author face-to-face on 03 November 2014.

Contact address

Monika Lengauer

Guinea-Bissau / TU University Dortmund, Germany

Email: monika_lengauer@hotmail.co.uk